

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 4

Budget Estimates 2004-2005

Ordered to be printed according to the Resolution of the House

New South Wales Parliamentary Library cataloguing-in-publication data:

New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. General Purpose Standing Committee No. 4

Budget Estimates, 2004-2005 : [report] / General Purpose Standing Committee No. 4. [Sydney, N.S.W.] : The Committee, 2005. –viii, 17 p. ; 30 cm. (Report ; no. 12)

Chair: Jenny Gardiner.

“Ordered to be printed according to the resolution of the House”.

ISBN 978-1-920788-06-3

1. Finance, Public—New South Wales.
2. Budget—New South Wales.
 - I. Title.
 - II. Gardiner, Jenny.
- III. Series: New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. General Purpose Standing Committee No. 4. Report ; no. 12

DDC 352.49944

How to contact the committee

Members of the General Purpose Standing Committee No. 4 can be contacted through the Committee Secretariat. Written correspondence and enquiries should be directed to:

The Director

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 4

Legislative Council

Parliament House, Macquarie Street

Sydney New South Wales 2000

Internet www.parliament.nsw.gov.au

Email gpscno4@parliament.nsw.gov.au

Telephone 02 9230 3544

Facsimile 02 9230 3416

Terms of Reference

1. That the Budget Estimates and related papers for the financial year 2004-2005 presenting the amounts to be appropriated from the Consolidated Fund be referred to the General Purpose Standing Committees for inquiry and report.
2. That the committees consider the Budget Estimates in accordance with the allocation of portfolios to the committees.
3. For the purposes of this inquiry any member of the House may attend a meeting of a committee in relation to the Budget Estimates and question witnesses, participate in the deliberations of the committee at such meeting and make a dissenting statement relating to the Budget Estimates, but may not vote or be counted for the purpose of any quorum.
4. The committees must hear evidence on the Budget Estimates in public.
5. Not more than 2 committees are to hear evidence on the Budget Estimates simultaneously.
6. When a committee hears evidence on the Budget Estimates, the Chair is to call on items of expenditure in the order decided on and declare the proposed expenditure open for examination.
7. The committees may ask for explanations from Ministers in the House, or officers of departments, statutory bodies or corporations, relating to the items of proposed expenditure.
8. The report of a committee on the Budget Estimates may propose the further consideration of any items.
9. That a daily Hansard record of the hearings of a committee on the Budget Estimates be published as soon as practicable after each day's proceedings.
10. That the Leader of the Government is to provide to each Committee, by 6 July 2004, a schedule outlining the attendance of relevant ministers to appear before each committee, for the committee's consideration.
11. The committees may hold supplementary hearings as required.
12. The committees present a final report to the House by the last sitting day of the second sitting week in 2005.

(Minutes of proceedings No 61, 23 June 2004, pages 886-888.)

These terms of reference were referred to the Committee by the House.

Committee Membership

Hon Jenny Gardiner MLC	The Nationals	<i>Chair</i>
Ms Sylvia Hale MLC	Greens	<i>Deputy Chair</i>
Ms Jan Burnswoods MLC	Australian Labor Party	
Hon Kayee Griffin MLC	Australian Labor Party	
Hon Greg Donnelly MLC ¹	Australian Labor Party	
Hon David Clarke MLC	Liberal Party	
Hon David Oldfield MLC	One Nation	

Other Members who attended the hearings

Hon Tony Catanzariti MLC	Australian Labor Party
Hon Michael Gallacher MLC	Liberal Party
Hon Don Harwin MLC	Liberal Party
Hon Eddie Obeid MLC	Australian Labor Party
Hon Melinda Pavey MLC	Liberal Party
Hon John Ryan MLC	Liberal Party
Hon Ian West MLC	Australian Labor Party

¹ The Hon Eric Roozendaal was a Member of the Committee until 2 May 2005.

Table of Contents

	Chair's Foreword	vii
Chapter 1	Introduction	1
	Examination of budget estimates	1
	Portfolios	1
Chapter 2	Public hearings – by portfolio	2
	Transport Services, Hunter	2
	Transport Services	2
	Hunter	3
	Infrastructure, Planning & Natural Resources	3
	Infrastructure and Planning	3
	Natural Resources	3
	Roads and Housing	5
	Roads	5
	Housing	5
	Energy, Utilities and Sustainability, Science and Medical Research	6
	Energy and Utilities	6
Appendix 1	Witnesses	8
Appendix 2	Minutes of proceedings	10

Chair's Foreword

General Purpose Standing Committee No. 4 has examined the Budget Estimates for 2004-2005 for the portfolio areas of:

- Science and Medical Research
- Infrastructure Planning and Natural Resources
- The Hunter
- Housing
- Roads
- Transport Services
- Energy, Utilities and Sustainability

The Committee expresses its appreciation to the Ministers and officers of the departments and organisations who appeared before it.

Hon Jenny Gardiner MLC

Committee Chair

Chapter 1 Introduction

Examination of budget estimates

- 1.1 General Purpose Standing Committee No 4 examined the Budget Estimates and related documents for its portfolios at a series of public hearings held on the following dates:
- 13 September 2004 Transport Services and the Hunter
 - 14 September 2004 Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources
 - 15 September 2004 Roads and Housing
 - 17 September 2004 Energy, Utilities and Sustainability, Science and Medical Research
- 1.2 Supplementary hearings were held for: Energy Utilities and Sustainability (9 February 2005); Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources (9 February 2005, 21 March 2005 and 19 April 2005); Roads and Housing (10 February 2005) and Transport (10 February 2005)
- 1.3 This report outlines the administrative details of the budget estimates hearing process and a brief summary of some of the key issues raised. The full transcript of evidence taken at these hearings can be found at the Committee's Web page accessible via the Parliament's home page at: www.parliament.nsw.gov.au/budgetestimates. Hard copies of the transcript can be obtained by contacting the General Purpose Standing Committee Secretariat on 02 9230 3544.
- 1.4 During the hearings, Ministers took a number of questions on notice. In addition the Committee lodged written questions on notice for all the portfolio areas by following the usual procedure of placing questions on the notice paper with the Clerks at the Table on days that the House sits.
- 1.5 The Committee is pleased to note that answers have been provided to the questions placed on notice. Copies of the questions and answers can be found at the Committee's Web page at the above address or by contacting the secretariat on the above number.

Portfolios

- Science and Medical Research
- Infrastructure Planning and Natural Resources
- The Hunter
- Housing
- Roads
- Transport Services
- Energy, Utilities and Sustainability

Chapter 2 Public hearings – by portfolio

The key topics discussed at the hearing are provided below. For further details on these, and other matters, see the Hansard record of the hearing, available on the Committee's web page accessible via the Parliament's website at www.parliament.nsw.gov.au.

Transport Services, Hunter

2.1 On 13 September 2004 the Committee conducted public hearings into the portfolios of Transport Service and the Hunter.

Transport Services

2.2 Amongst the issues discussed, rail services in rural and regional areas and counter-terrorism measures were a particular focus. Other key issues discussed included:

- review of CountryLink Services
- services on grain lines
- handling of allegations of corruption by RailCorp
- redeployment of displaced employees
- numbers and powers of transit officers
- bus ticketing
- Lower Hunter transport services
- CCTV remote monitoring
- use of consultants

Supplementary hearing

2.3 On 10 February 2005 a supplementary hearing was conducted. The key issues discussed concerned:

- timetable changes to CityRail services
- speed limits and on-time rates for CountryLink Services
- Reliability Improvement Program
- Waterfall rail accident
- McInerney Report recommendations
- Easy Access Program
- complaints regarding Transit Officers

Hunter

- 2.4 The main issue discussed was the Hunter Valley Training Company.

Infrastructure, Planning & Natural Resources

- 2.5 On 14 September 2004 the Committee conducted public hearings into the portfolios of Infrastructure, Planning & Natural Resources.

Infrastructure and Planning

- 2.6 Key issues discussed during the public hearing included:
- closure of the Orange Grove Designer Outlet Centre
 - recruitment of former ministerial staff at Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources (DIPNR)
 - appointment of BSR consultants
 - availability of planning reform taskforce reports
 - planning reform consultation mechanisms
 - appointment of Director-General's driver
 - metropolitan strategy
 - restructure of DIPNR
 - 'Plan First' program

Natural Resources

- 2.7 In the public hearing, the national water initiative was the key issue discussed. Other matters considered included:
- Brigalow Forest
 - water entitlement licences
 - environmental flow allocations
 - Bringelly land release infrastructure costs

Supplementary hearings

- 2.8 On 9 February 2005 a supplementary hearing was conducted. The key issues discussed concerned:
- Deloitte's Internal Audit report
 - payment of allowances to a certain DIPNR officer

- Director-General's use of driver
- plans for revitalisation of Parramatta Rd and extension of M4 East tunnel
- Metropolitan Strategy
- planning reforms

2.9 On 21 March 2005, a second supplementary hearing was held. The key issues discussed were:

- restructure and staffing of the Department
- use of taxis by departmental officers
- the Property Vegetation Plan Developer Tool
- environmental flows and extraction of water from Shoalhaven River
- Land Management Branch staff and activities
- State Infrastructure Strategic Plan
- native vegetation management
- regional strategic plans for the NSW coast
- proposed F6 and the Metropolitan Strategy
- Barwon-Darling Catchment Action Plan
- Water Sharing Plans
- targets and performance measures

2.10 On 19 April 2005, a third supplementary hearing took place. The key matters discussed included:

- use of taxis by departmental officers
- telecommunications review project
- current status of the Metropolitan Strategy
- Director-General's responsibilities and use of resources
- air quality of the M5 East external stack
- status of the Infrastructure Council
- introduction of local environmental plans
- population projections and planning for population growth
- biodiversity planning
- property vegetation plans
- consultation with stakeholders, communities and staff
- ground water sharing plans

- rail infrastructure
- traffic predictions for the cross-city tunnel, Lane Cove tunnel and M4 East
- Catchment Management Authorities (CMAs).

Roads and Housing

2.11 On 15 September 2004 the Committee conducted public hearings into the portfolios of Roads and Housing.

Roads

- 2.12 Key issues discussed during the public hearing included:
- impact on roads of increased traffic for grain distribution
 - Legislative Council order for certain RTA papers
 - RTA report on study trip to Japan
 - tunnel filtration
 - heavy transport safety
 - Pacific Highway Ballina by-pass
 - Princes Highway upgrade projects
 - Albury by-pass construction

Supplementary hearing

2.13 On 10 February 2005 a supplementary hearing was conducted for the Roads portfolio. The key issues discussed concerned:

- timetable for commencement and/or completion of projects including the M4 East tunnel, the Alstonville bypass, Main Road 92 between Nowra and Nerriga, certain bridges between Nowra and Milton, and various other roads in rural areas
- gas emissions from the M5 East and cross city tunnels
- unlicensed drivers and unregistered vehicles
- priority projects for improving safety along the Pacific Highway
- road safety.

Housing

2.14 Discussion during the public hearing centred on policy and protocols for dealing with asbestos in public housing. Other issues discussed included:

- sale of Department of Housing stock

- public housing maintenance backlog
- tenant damage to housing stock
- redevelopment of Minto public housing estate

Supplementary hearing

2.15 On 10 February 2005 a supplementary hearing was conducted. The key issues discussed concerned:

- unoccupied public housing
- asbestos contamination in certain properties
- caravan park closures
- Commonwealth funding for public housing and rent assistance
- redevelopment of the Minto public housing estate
- value of public housing properties
- local government involvement in affordable housing.

Energy, Utilities and Sustainability, Science and Medical Research

2.16 On 17 September 2004 the Committee conducted public hearings into the portfolios of Energy and Utilities. No issues were raised relating to Science and Medical Research on this occasion.

Energy and Utilities

2.17 Amongst the issues discussed, the sustainability of Sydney's water supply and water restrictions were of particular focus. Other key issues discussed included:

- the metropolitan water strategy
- environmental responsibilities of water supply providers
- options for future water supply
- Georges River waste water strategy
- maintenance of Southern and Western Suburbs Ocean Outfalls Sewer Scheme
- alleged insurance fraud at Sydney Water
- appointment of CEO of Hunter Water
- water supply in the Hunter and Central Coast regions
- electricity demand management
- Macquarie Generation – expansion of generation capacity

Supplementary Hearing

2.18 On 9 February 2005, a supplementary hearing was held into the Energy, Utilities and Sustainability portfolio. Key issues discussed included:

- blackout occurrences
- electricity demand management
- electricity supply forecasts
- underground electricity lines
- appointment of the Director-General
- desalination plant proposal
- Metropolitan Water Plan and water restrictions
- drought management strategies

Appendix 1 Witnesses

1. Transport Services, Hunter

Date	Name	Position and Organisation
13 September 2004	Hon Michael Costa MLC	Minister for Transport Services, and Minister for the Hunter, and Minister assisting the Minister for State Development
	Mr Vince Graham	Chief Executive Officer, RailCorp
	Ms Carolyn Walsh	Chief Executive Officer, Transport Safety and Reliability Regulator
	Mr Bob Pentecost AM	Chief Executive Officer, Rail Infrastructure Corporation
	Mr Chris Oxenbould AO	Acting Chief Executive, NSW Maritime
	Mr Mark Duffy	Acting Director General
	Mr John Lee	Acting Chief Executive Officer, Ministry of Transport
	Ms Sue Sinclair	Chief Executive Officer, Sydney Ferries Corporation
10 February 2005 (supplementary hearing)	Mr Vince Graham	Chief Executive Officer, RailCorp

2. Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources

Date	Name	Position and Organisation
14 September 2004	Hon Craig Knowles MP	Minister for Infrastructure and Planning, Minister for Natural Resources
	Ms Jennifer Westacott	Director-General, Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources
	Mr Peter Lucas	Chief Financial Officer, Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources
9 February 2005 (supplementary hearing)	Ms Jennifer Westacott	Director-General, Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources
	Mr Peter Sutherland	Deputy Director-General, Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources
	Mr Peter Lucas	Chief Financial Officer, Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources
	Mr Gary Prattley	Acting Director-General, Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources
	Mr Glenn Smith	Executive Director, Corporate Services, Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources
	Mr Sam Haddad	Deputy Director General, Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources

Date	Name	Position and Organisation
21 March 2005	Mr Sam Haddad	Acting Director-General, Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources
(supplementary hearing)	Mr Peter Lucas	Chief Financial Officer, Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources
	Mr Peter Sutherland	Deputy Director General, Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources

3. Roads and Housing

Date	Name	Position and Organisation
15 September 2004	The Hon Carl Scully MP	Minister for Roads, and Minister for Housing
	Mr Terry Barnes	Director-General, Department of Housing
	Mr Terry Downing	A/Executive Director, Housing Systems, Department of Housing
	Mr John Stubbs	Chief Financial Officer, Department of Housing
	Ms Leonie King	A/Director, Office of the Director General, Department of Housing
	Mr Paul Forward	Chief Executive Officer, Roads and Traffic Authority
	Mr Brett Skinner	Director Finance, Roads and Traffic Authority
10 February 2005	Mr Terry Barnes	Director-General, Department of Housing
(supplementary hearing)	Mr Mike Allen	Deputy Director-General, Operations
	Mr Paul Forward	Chief Executive Officer, Roads and Traffic Authority

4. Energy and Utilities, Science and Medical Research

Date	Name	Position and Organisation
17 September 2004	The Hon Frank Sartor MP	Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Science and Medical Research
	Mr Dave Evans	Managing Director, Sydney Water Corporation
	Mr Kevin Young	Managing Director, Hunter Water Corporation
	Mr David Nemptzow	Director-General, Department of Energy, Utilities and Sustainability
	Mr Grant Every-Burns	Managing Director, Macquarie Generation
	Mr David Croft	Managing Director, TransGrid
9 February 2005	Mr David Nemptzow	Director-General, Department of Energy, Utilities, and Sustainability
(supplementary hearing)	Mr Dave Evans	Managing Director, Sydney Water Corporation

Appendix 2 Minutes of proceedings

Minutes No 45

Monday 13 September 2004

At Parliament House at 5.15pm, Jubilee Room

1. Members Present

Ms Jenny Gardiner (*Chair*)

Ms Sylvia Hale (*Deputy Chair*)

Ms Jan Burnswoods

Mr Tony Catanzariti (Roozendaal)

Mr Michael Gallacher (Clarke)

Ms Kayee Griffin

Mr David Oldfield

2. Substitute arrangements

The Chair advised that Mr Gallacher would be representing Mr Clarke and Mr Catanzariti would be representing Mr Roozendaal for the purposes of this meeting.

3. Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Hon Michael Costa MLC, Minister for Transport Services, and Minister for the Hunter, and Minister assisting the Minister for State Development was admitted and accompanied by the following advisers:

RailCorp

Vince Graham, Chief Executive Officer

Transport Safety and Reliability Regulator

Carolyn Walsh, Chief Executive Officer

Rail Infrastructure Corporation

Bob Pentecost AM, Chief Executive Officer

NSW Maritime

Chris Oxenbould AO, Acting Chief Executive

Ministry of Transport

Mark Duffy, Acting Director General

John Lee, Acting Chief Executive Officer

Sydney Ferries Corporation

Sue Sinclair, Chief Executive Officer

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on budget estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Transport Services and the Hunter open for examination.

The Minister and his advisers answered questions by Members of the Committee.

The Chair advised the witnesses that the Committee has resolved to seek the return of answers to questions on notice within 35 calendar days and that the Committee may hold further hearings.

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Transport Services and the Hunter concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The Committee deliberated.

Mr Gallacher moved that the Committee hold a further hearing on a date to be determined by the Chair after consulting with Committee members to consider matters relating to the portfolio area of Transport, to consider:

- matters relating to the proposed expenditure of the Transport Services and the Hunter portfolios,
- matters relating to questions taken on notice at today's hearing,
- matters relating to written answers or additional information provided by the Minister.

Question put.

The Committee divided.

Ayes: Ms Hale, Mr Oldfield, Mr Gallacher, Ms Gardiner

Noes: Ms Burnswoods, Ms Griffin, Mr Catanzariti.

Question resolved in the affirmative.

4. **Adjournment**

The Committee adjourned at 7:42 pm until 5.15pm on Tuesday 14 September 2004.

Steven Reynolds

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 46

Tuesday 14 September 2004

At Parliament House at 5.15pm, Jubilee Room

1. **Members present**

Ms Jenny Gardiner (*Chair*)

Ms Sylvia Hale (*Deputy Chair*)

Mr Tony Catanzariti (Roozendaal)

Mr John Ryan (Clarke)

Ms Kayee Griffin

Mr David Oldfield

Ms Jan Burnswoods

2. **Substitute arrangements**

The Chair advised that Mr Catanzariti would be representing Mr Roozendaal and Mr Ryan would be replacing Mr Clarke for the purposes of this meeting

3. Correspondence

Sent

- 7 September 2004 from Chair, GPSC No. 4 to Director, General Purpose Standing Committees, requesting the attendance of the Managing Directors/General Managers of Sydney Water, Hunter Water, Macquarie Generation, TransGrid with the Minister for Energy, Utilities, Medical Science at the estimates hearing on Friday 17 September 2004.
- 7 September 2004 from Director, Budget Estimates Committees, to the Hon F E Sartor, MP, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Minister for Science and Medical Research, Minister Assisting the Minister for Health (Cancer) and Minister Assisting the Premier on the Arts, forwarding the request for attendance of particular officers on Friday 17 September 2004.

4. Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Hon Craig Knowles MP, Minister for Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources, was admitted and accompanied by the following advisers:

Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources

Jennifer Westacott, Director General

Peter Lucas, Chief Financial Officer

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on budget estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Planning, Natural Resources and Infrastructure open for examination, the first hour devoted to Planning and the second hour devoted to Natural Resources and Infrastructure.

The Minister and his advisers answered questions by Members of the Committee.

The Minister tabled three folders of documents relating to the Inquiry into the approval of the Designer Outlets Centre, Liverpool (Orange Grove).

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Planning, Natural Resources and Infrastructure concluded.

The Chair advised the witnesses that the Committee has resolved to seek the return of answers to questions on notice within 35 calendar days and that the Committee may hold further hearings.

The witnesses and the public withdrew.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Ryan, that under section 4 of the *Parliamentary Papers (Supplementary Provisions) Act 1975* and under the authority of Standing Order 224, the Committee authorise the Clerk of the Committee to publish the documents accepted by the Committee during today's hearing.

Ms Hale moved that the Committee hold a further hearing on a date to be determined by the Chair after consulting with Committee members to consider matters relating to the portfolio area of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources, to consider:

- matters relating to the proposed expenditure of the Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources portfolios,

- matters relating to questions taken on notice at today's hearing,
- matters relating to written answers or additional information provided by the Minister.

Question put.

The Committee divided.

Ayes: Ms Hale, Mr Oldfield, Mr Ryan, Ms Gardiner

Noes: Ms Burnswoods, Ms Griffin, Mr Catanzariti.

Question resolved in the affirmative.

5. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 7:40pm until 8.00pm on Wednesday 15 September 2004.

Rachel Callinan

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 47

Wednesday 15 September 2004

At Parliament House at 7.45pm, Legislative Council Chamber

1. Members Present

Ms Jenny Gardiner (*Chair*)

Ms Sylvia Hale (*Deputy Chair*)

Ms Kayee Griffin

Mr Don Harwin (Clarke)

Mr Edward Obeid (Roozendaal)

Mr David Oldfield (present from 8:45pm)

Mr Ian West (Burnswoods)

2. Substitute arrangements

The Chair advised that Mr Obeid would be replacing Mr Roozendaal, Mr Harwin would be replacing Mr Clarke and Mr West would be replacing Ms Burnswoods for the purposes of this meeting.

3. Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Hon Carl Scully MP, Minister for Roads, and Minister for Housing was admitted and accompanied by the following advisers:

Department of Housing

Mr Terry Barnes, Director General, NSW Department of Housing

Mr Terry Downing, A/Executive Director, Housing Systems

Mr John Stubbs, Chief Financial Officer

Ms Leonie King, A/Director, Office of the Director General

Roads and Traffic Authority

Mr Paul Forward, Chief Executive

Mr Brett Skinner, Director Finance

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on budget estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Roads and Housing open for examination.

The Minister and his advisers answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Ms Hale tabled the following documents in relation to Housing:

- 'The Home of Fine Bathrooms Where We Do It Wright for You'
- 'Report of Analysis for Asbestos in Bulk Samples'
- 'Energy Australia Approved Contractor Quotation'
- Photograph of Asbestos in Yard
- Photograph of Ceiling
- Photograph of Asbestos dust

Mr Harwin tabled the following documents in relation to Housing:

- 'Memo to Executive Directors from Terry Barnes in relation to the use of acronyms in briefing notes'

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Roads and Housing concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The Committee deliberated.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Harwin, that under section 4 of the *Parliamentary Papers (Supplementary Provisions) Act 1975* and under the authority of Standing Order 224, the Committee authorises the Clerk of the Committee to publish the documents accepted by the Committee during today's hearing.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Harwin, that the Committee hold a further hearing on a date to be determined by the Chair after consulting with Committee members to consider matters relating to the portfolio areas of Roads and Housing

4. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 10.10pm until 9.00am on Friday 17 September 2004.

Susan Want

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 48

Friday 17 September 2004

At Parliament House at 8:45am

1. Members Present

Ms Jenny Gardiner (*Chair*)

Ms Sylvia Hale (*Deputy Chair*)

Ms Jan Burnswoods
 Mr David Clarke
 Ms Kayee Griffin
 Mr Eric Roozendaal
 Ms Melinda Pavey (in attendance)

2. Apologies

Mr David Oldfield

3. Substitute arrangements

The Chair advised that there are no substitutes.

4. Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Hon Frank Sartor MP, Minister for Energy and Utilities, Science and Medical Research, was admitted and accompanied by the following advisers:

Mr Dave Evans, Managing Director, Sydney Water Corporation
 Mr Kevin Young, Managing Director, Hunter Water Corporation
 Mr David Nemptzow, Director General, Department of Energy, Utilities and Sustainability
 Mr Grant Every-Burns, Managing Director, Macquarie Generation
 Mr David Croft, Managing Director, TransGrid.

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on budget estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Energy and Utilities, Science and Medical Research open for examination.

The Minister and his advisers answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Energy and Utilities, Science and Medical Research concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The Committee deliberated.

Ms Hale requested that mobile phones be turned off at all future meetings.

Mr Clarke moved, that the Committee hold a further hearing on a date to be determined by the Chair after consulting with Committee members to consider matters relating to the portfolio areas of Energy and Utilities, Science and Medical Research.

Question put.

Ayes: Ms Gardiner, Mr Clarke, Ms Hale
 Noes: Ms Burnswoods, Ms Griffin, Mr Roozendaal

There being an equality of votes, the Chair cast her vote with the ayes.

The question resolved in the affirmative.

5. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 11.07am until 10.00am on Monday 20 September 2004.

Julie Langsworth

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 55

Thursday 16 December 2004

Room 1108, Parliament House, Sydney at 9.40am

1. Members Present

Ms Gardiner (*Chair*)

Ms Hale (*Deputy Chair*)

Ms Burnswoods

Ms Griffin

Dr Chesterfield-Evans (Mr Oldfield)

Mr Primrose

Mr Ryan

2. Substitute Members

The Chair advised the Committee that Dr Chesterfield-Evans would be substituting for Mr Oldfield at this meeting.

3. ...

4. Confirmation of Minutes

Resolved on motion of Mr Ryan: That Minutes 54 be confirmed.

5. ...

6. ...

7. Estimates 2004-2005

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Ryan: That the timing of the portfolio hearings be placed in the hands of the Chair, with details of proposed timing and witnesses circulated to Committee members.

Question put and passed.

8. Next meeting

The Committee adjourned at 6:50 pm until 9.30am on 9 February 2005.

Steven Reynolds

Committee Clerk

Minutes No 56

Wednesday 9 February 2005

At Parliament House at 9.37am

1. Members Present

Ms Jenny Gardiner (*Chair*)

Ms Sylvia Hale (*Deputy Chair*)
 Ms Jan Burnswoods
 Mr David Clarke (to 12.30pm)
 Mr John Ryan (from 2.00pm)
 Ms Kayee Griffin
 Mr Eric Roozendaal
 Mr David Oldfield

2. Substitute arrangements

The Chair advised that Mr John Ryan was substituting for Mr David Clarke for the afternoon session only.

3. Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Director General of the Department of Energy, Utilities and Sustainability, Mr David Nemptzow and Mr David Evans, Chief Executive Officer, Sydney Water were admitted.

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on budget estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Energy, Utilities and Sustainability open for examination.

Mr Nemptzow and Mr Evans answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Energy, Utilities and Sustainability concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The Committee adjourned for a short break at 12.30pm and reconvened at 2.00pm.

The Director General of the Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources, Ms Jennifer Westacott was admitted, accompanied by the following advisors:

Department of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources

Mr Peter Sutherland, Deputy Director General
 Mr Sam Haddad, Deputy Director General
 Mr Gary Prattley, Acting Deputy Director General
 Mr Peter Lucas, Chief Financial Officer
 Mr Glenn Smith, Executive Director Corporate Services

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources open for examination.

Ms Westacott, Mr Prattley, Mr Sutherland, Mr Lucas, Mr Smith and Mr Haddad answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Point of order: Ms Burnswoods took a point of order regarding the relevance of a question from the Chair.

The Chair ruled there was no point of order.

Mr Roozendaal moved that the Committee dissent from the ruling of the Chair and presented his reasons in writing.

The question was put and the Committee divided.

Ayes:

Ms Jan Burnswoods

Ms Kayee Griffin

Mr Eric Roozendaal

Noes:

Miss Gardiner

Ms Sylvia Hale

Mr David Oldfield

Mr John Ryan

The motion was defeated. The Chair's ruling was upheld.

Ms Burnswoods raised a point of order regarding the relevance of a question from Mr Oldfield. Mr Oldfield responded to the point of order. The Chair ruled that the question was in order.

Ms Burnswoods moved that the Committee dissent from the ruling of the Chair and presented her reasons in writing.

The question was put and the Committee divided.

Ayes:

Ms Jan Burnswoods

Ms Kayee Griffin

Mr Eric Roozendaal

Noes:

Miss Gardiner

Ms Sylvia Hale

Mr David Oldfield

Mr John Ryan

The motion was defeated. The Chair's ruling was upheld.

Mr Ryan moved:

that Mr Oldfield be given an additional five minutes of questioning time.

Debate ensued.

The question was put and the Committee divided.

Ayes:

Miss Gardiner

Ms Sylvia Hale

Mr David Oldfield

Mr John Ryan

Noes:

Ms Burnswoods
Ms Griffin
Mr Roozendaal

Question resolved in the affirmative. Resolved, on the motion of Mr Ryan, that Mr Oldfield be given an additional five minutes of questioning time.

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

4. Deliberative meeting

Mr Ryan moved:

that the Committee hold a further hearing on a date to be determined by the Chair in consultation with the Committee, to further consider the Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources portfolio.

Debate ensued.

Ms Burnswoods moved an amendment to Mr Ryan's motion: that all words after "that" be omitted and that the following be inserted:

This Committee take action to correct the record of today's proceedings relating to the use of a car and driver by Ms Westacott, and in particular the use of such words as "inconsistencies" to refer to evidence given today and evidence given on 14 September 2004. The Committee especially notes that the transcript of 14 September 2004 shows that Minister Knowles, after persistent questions from Mr Oldfield said, "Ms Westacott gave me permission to offer to tell you privately what her medical condition is", and that this offer was ignored (p11, Transcript of Evidence, GPSC 4, 14 September 2004). The Committee also especially notes that (contrary to allegations of inconsistency made today) Mr Oldfield asked Ms Westcott "is there something specific in your condition that expressly precludes you from being able to operate a motor vehicle?" and that she replied "There is something in my medical condition that impacts on my driving that relates to my sight". (p12)

Debate ensued.

Amendment put. The Committee divided.

Ayes:

Ms Burnswoods
Ms Griffin
Mr Roozendaal

Noes:

Miss Gardiner
Ms Sylvia Hale
Mr David Oldfield
Mr John Ryan

The question was resolved in the negative.

Mr Ryan's original motion put:

that the Committee hold a further hearing on a date to be determined by the Chair in consultation with the Committee, to further consider the Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources portfolio.

The Committee divided:

Ayes:

Miss Gardiner
Ms Sylvia Hale
Mr David Oldfield
Mr John Ryan

Noes:

Ms Burnswoods
Ms Griffin
Mr Roozendaal

Question resolved in the affirmative. Resolved, on the motion of Mr Ryan, that the Committee hold a further hearing on a date to be determined by the Chair in consultation with the Committee, to further consider the Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources portfolio.

Mr Ryan moved:

that the Chair seek an extension from the House to extend the reporting date of the Committee until 31 March 2005.

Debate ensued.

Question put. The Committee divided:

Ayes:

Miss Gardiner
Ms Sylvia Hale
Mr David Oldfield
Mr John Ryan

Noes:

Ms Burnswoods
Ms Griffin
Mr Roozendaal

Question resolved in the affirmative. Resolved, on the motion of Mr Ryan, that the Chair seek an extension from the House to extend the reporting date of the Committee until 31 March 2005

5. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 5.03pm until 9.30am on Thursday 10 February 2005.

Tanya Bosch

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 57

Thursday 10 February 2005
At Parliament House at 9.35am

1. Members Present

Ms Jenny Gardiner (*Chair*)
Ms Sylvia Hale (*Deputy Chair*) (to 2pm)
Ms Jan Burnswoods
Mr Don Harwin (to 12.30pm)
Mr Michael Gallacher (from 2.00pm)
Ms Kayee Griffin
Ms Lee Rhiannon (from 2.00pm)
Mr Eric Roozendaal
Mr David Oldfield

2. Substitute arrangements

The Chair advised that Mr Don Harwin was substituting for Mr David Clarke for the morning session, and that Mr Michael Gallacher was substituting for Mr David Clarke, and Ms Lee Rhiannon for Ms Sylvia Hale, for the afternoon session.

3. Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The Chair made a statement to Members regarding the broadcasting of proceedings.

The Chief Executive Officer of the Roads and Traffic Authority, Mr Paul Forward, was admitted.

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair made a statement regarding certain procedural matters during hearings on budget estimates.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio area of Roads open for examination.

Mr Forward answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio area of the Roads concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The Director General, Department of Housing, Mr Terry Barnes, was admitted and accompanied by the following advisor:

Mr Mike Allen, Deputy Director General, Operations, Department of Housing.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio area of Housing open for examination.

Mr Barnes and Mr Allen answered questions by Members of the Committee.

The Committee adjourned for a short break at 12.32pm and reconvened at 2.05pm.

The Chief Executive Officer of Rail Corp, Mr Vince Graham, was admitted.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio area of Rail open for examination.

Mr Graham answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio area of Rail concluded and the witness withdrew.

4. ...

5. **Adjournment**

The Committee adjourned at 5.05pm.

Tanya Bosch

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No 60

Monday 21 March 2004

At Parliament House at 1:05pm

1. **Members Present**

Ms Jenny Gardiner (*Chair*)

Ms Sylvia Hale (*Deputy Chair*)

Ms Jan Burnswoods

Mr Greg Pearce (substituting for Mr David Clarke)

Ms Kayee Griffin

Mr Eric Roozendaal

Mr David Oldfield (arrived at 1:15pm)

2. **Substitute arrangements**

The Chair advised that Mr Greg Pearce was substituting for Mr David Clarke.

3. **Budget Estimates 2004-2005**

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources open for examination.

The Chair advised members that Ms Westacott, Director General of the Department of Planning, Infrastructure and Natural Resources was unable to attend the hearing, but that Mr Sam Haddad, Acting Director General was appearing in her place. Mr Haddad was accompanied by Mr Peter Sutherland, Deputy Director General and Mr Peter Lucas, Chief Financial Officer.

Representatives from the Department answered questions by Members of the Committee.

Questioning concluded, the witnesses withdrew.

4. Deliberative – Budget Estimates and Sydney Harbour Foreshore Authority

Correspondence Received

- Copy of Deloitte's report from Department of Planning, Infrastructure and Natural Resources (previously distributed) tabled and, on the motion of Mr Pearce, made public

Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The Committee discussed inviting the Director General of the Department of Planning, Infrastructure and Natural Resources to appear before the Committee at a further supplementary hearing.

Ms Hale moved:

that the Committee hold a further hearing to hear from the Director General, Ms Westacott and other relevant Departmental Officers, on a date to be determined by the Chair after consulting with Committee members to consider matters relating to the portfolio areas of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources.

Debate ensued.

Ms Burnswoods moved an amendment to Ms Hale's motion:

that all words after "that" be omitted and that the following words be inserted "the Committee defer inviting DIPNR to appear for a fourth time until after receipt of answers to questions on notice, due tomorrow, and that Committee members provide an indication to the officers of DIPNR of the kinds of issues they wish to raise."

Amendment put. The Committee divided.

Ayes:

Ms Burnswoods
Ms Griffin
Mr Roozendaal

Noes:

Miss Gardiner
Ms Sylvia Hale
Mr David Oldfield
Mr Greg Pearce

The question was resolved in the negative.

Ms Hale's original motion put:

that the Committee hold a further hearing to hear from the Director General, Ms Westacott and other relevant Departmental Officers, on a date to be determined by the Chair after consulting with Committee members to consider matters relating to the portfolio areas of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources.

The Committee divided:

Ayes:

Miss Gardiner

Ms Sylvia Hale
Mr David Oldfield
Mr Greg Pearce

Noes:
Ms Burnswoods
Ms Griffin
Mr Roozendaal

Question resolved in the affirmative. Resolved, on the motion of Ms Hale, that the Committee hold a further hearing to hear from the Director General, Ms Westacott and other relevant Departmental Officers, on a date to be determined by the Chair after consulting with Committee members to consider matters relating to the portfolio areas of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources.

Mr Pearce moved:

that the Director General and relevant Departmental Officers be invited to appear before the Committee for three hours.

Debate ensued.

Ms Burnswoods moved an amendment to Mr Pearce's motion:

that all words after "that" be omitted and that the following be inserted Director General and relevant Departmental Officers be invited to appear before the Committee for five minutes.

Amendment put. The Committee divided.

Ayes:
Ms Burnswoods
Ms Griffin
Mr Roozendaal

Noes:
Miss Gardiner
Ms Sylvia Hale
Mr David Oldfield
Mr Greg Pearce

The question was resolved in the negative.

Ms Hale's original motion put:

that the Director General and relevant Departmental Officers be invited to appear before the Committee for three hours.

The Committee divided:

Ayes:
Miss Gardiner
Ms Sylvia Hale
Mr David Oldfield
Mr Greg Pearce

Noes:

Ms Burnswoods

Ms Griffin

Mr Roozendaal

Question resolved in the affirmative. Resolved, on the motion of Ms Hale that the Director General and relevant Departmental Officers be invited to appear before the Committee for three hours.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Pearce, that the Chair seek an extension from the House to extend the reporting date of the Committee until 16 May 2005.

...

5. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 3:22pm.

Tanya Bosch

Clerk to the Committee

Minutes No. 61

Tuesday 19 April 2005

At Parliament House at 2:02pm

1. Members Present

Ms Jenny Gardiner (*Chair*)

Ms Sylvia Hale (*Deputy Chair*) (arrived 2.04pm)

Ms Amanda Fazio (substituting for Ms Jan Burnswoods) (arrived 2.11)

Mr John Ryan (substituting for Mr David Clarke)

Ms Kayee Griffin

Mr Eric Roozendaal

Mr David Oldfield (arrived at 2:07pm)

2. Substitute arrangements

The Chair advised that Ms Amanda Fazio was substituting for Ms Jan Burnswoods and that Mr John Ryan was substituting for Mr David Clarke.

3. Budget Estimates 2004-2005

The public and media were admitted.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio areas of Infrastructure, Planning and Natural Resources open for examination.

Ms Westacott, Director General of the Department of Planning, Infrastructure and Natural Resources was accompanied by Mr Sam Haddad, Acting Director General, Mr Glenn Smith, Executive Director, Corporate Services and Mr Peter Lucas, Chief Financial Officer.

Ms Westacott tendered the following document:

Letter from Mal Peters, President, NSW Farmers' Association dated 18 April 2005

Resolved on the motion of Ms Fazio that the document be accepted and made public.

Representatives from the Department answered questions by Members of the Committee.

The Committee adjourned at 3.53pm and resumed at 3.58pm

Questioning concluded, the witnesses withdrew.

4. Adjournment

The Committee adjourned at 5:05pm.

Tanya Bosch

Clerk to the Committee